

Bar Harbor Ferry Terminal Property
Leadership Committee
November 14, 2017

The Bar Harbor Ferry Terminal Property Leadership Committee appreciates the charge given them by the Town Council two months ago and has endeavored to develop a thoughtful and responsible recommendation for the long-term benefit of the citizens of Bar Harbor.

Recommendation to Bar Harbor Town Council:

The committee recommends purchasing the property for \$3.5 million and developing a business plan with the help of Bermello Ajamil to accommodate a multi-use marine facility with optional tender boat landings from cruise ships. The committee requests the town of Bar Harbor work actively with the Maine DOT to assist financially in the development of the facility through grants, bonds and other actions including technical assistance. The goals that underpin this recommendation are as follows:

- To improve residents' and visitors' enjoyment of Agamont Park on cruise days
- To ease vehicular traffic and parking by busses, taxis, etc. on cruise days
- To create public access to the water at the ferry terminal site
- To improve the cruise ship passenger experience
- To cause the least amount of harm environmentally
- To make the project financially viable
- To provide additional parking

The committee further recommends the following:

- Explore whether Bay Ferries can be compatible with these uses and potentially financially beneficial. If the business plan or Bay Ferries' needs preclude a multi-use marine facility with tendering, the committee prioritizes marine uses including a transportation hub at the property over Bay Ferries.
- The town council move toward consolidating cruise buses, taxis, etc. at the ferry terminal as part of implementation of the multi-use marine and transportation facility.

The committee wishes to note that their recommendations do not envision growth in cruise ship passengers, which was consistent with extensive community input on the subject.

Details	Pier with Berthing				Marine Multi-Use Facility				Tendering with Marine Multi-Use Facility				MDOT Sells Property				MDOT Sells Property To Town				
	CRITERIA	DESCRIPTION OR DATA	RATING	WEIGHTING FACTOR	SCORE	Compatible with tendering				2 tendering docks and floats for marina				Town Does Not Purchase the Ferry Terminal Property				Town Purchases the Ferry Terminal Property for \$3.5 million			
						DESCRIPTION OR DATA	RATING	WEIGHTING FACTOR	SCORE	DESCRIPTION OR DATA	RATING	WEIGHTING FACTOR	SCORE	DESCRIPTION OR DATA	RATING	WEIGHTING FACTOR	SCORE	DESCRIPTION OR DATA	RATING	WEIGHTING FACTOR	SCORE
FINANCIAL																					
Category																					
Extent of borrowing		211-20 million borrowed. Need to include operations and maintenance	2	4	8	Approx \$6.6 million bond	4	4	16	Approx \$6.6 million bond	4	4	16	There is no borrowing for this option	5	4	20	For purchase and possible environmental remediation, borrowing could be from \$3.5 - \$5 million.	4	4	16
Certainty of payback based on 2017 passenger visits (180,000)		We may be able to get the same payback to the town simply by increasing passenger fees, without risk of borrowing. Confident passengers will continue to come to BH even without a berthing pier	2	4	8	Manageable level of risk to support trans and commercial boat operations even if cruise passenger numbers decline.	4	4	16	Would need \$3 increase for cruise passengers to handle transportation. Looks positive initially but needs further analysis.	4	4	16	There is no payback.	5	4	20	Payback could be combination of tax money and a portion of cruise ship funds	3	4	12
Financial viability		Disproportionately large relative to other opportunities. Berthing pier is a near-permanent commitment. What is potential to increase fees? Opportunity cost not accounted for: what else could we spend this money on?	2	6	12	Diversified revenue streams spreads out the risk. Allows flexible growth and adaptation to market circumstances. Current analysis shows the plan to be self-supporting. Insulated from international events.	4	6	24	Estimate break even or positive return. Diversified revenue streams spreads out the risk. Allows flexible growth and adaptation to market circumstances. Current analysis shows the plan to be self-supporting. Insulated from international events.	4	6	24	There is no risk to the Town.	1	6	6	Without development, this is investment for town.	3	6	18
Impact on property taxes to individual taxpayers		Small upside potential, might need to pick up some of the debt. Possible negative effects on property values/taxes	2	6	12	Uncertain impacts. Potential revenue source for town's general fund	3	6	18	Expect no impact unless cruise business declines or marina is under-utilized in which case exposure is modest. (Higher rating than Marine Use is due to docking and tendering fees)	4	6	24	Property Taxes would be paid on this property by buyer. No increase to tax payers due to this property. (could be non-profit or state use with no payment of property tax)	3	6	18	Would increase property tax for residents until property is sold or revenue is generated once property is developed and operated.	3	6	18
SUBTOTAL																					
Category																					
				20	40					20	40					20	64				
ENVIRONMENTAL																					
Category																					
Visual impacts/improvements to local neighboring and historic properties, Frenchman's Bay, Acadia National Park and the All American Road.		Negative impacts from Paradise Hill and Loop Road. Impacts to the west side of town, particularly abutters. Would be more difficult for CDA to attract students? Ships would be closer to land and look exponentially larger.	1	5	5	Improves property relative to current conditions. Comparable visual scale to existing uses. Preserves view to ocean.	5	5	25	Elimination of existing pier, floats, boats, ships and marina will be scale with surrounding properties.	5	5	25	Unknown because buyer is unknown. However, Town does have expectation (with MDOT) that any future buyer of property would responsibly own, develop, and operate property; possible risk if buyer does not meet these expectations.	1	5	5	Without development, there is minimum impact (periodic maintenance). With clean up, could be positive impact.	2	5	10
Noise impacts (including future testing to demonstrate compliance with applicable guidelines and ordinances) and light pollution.		Noise may bounce off land and reverberate. As with other pollutants, impacts increase exponentially with proximity. Light pollution from ships berthed on the pier, close to other uses, will be a concern.	1	3	3	Minimal change assuming lobster boats stay in town. Any noise impacts would be in daytime, preventing impacts to neighboring hotel guests.	4	3	12	Minor impacts from commercial uses. Minimal change assuming lobster boats stay in town. Any noise impacts would be in daytime, preventing impacts to neighboring hotel guests.	4	3	12	Same as above	1	3	3	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	3	6
Air quality (including future testing to demonstrate compliance with applicable guidelines and ordinances)		Concerned that air quality on land would be impacted over having ships at anchor, wind direction (abutters)	2	4	8	Little to no change; low impact	4	4	16	Little to no change; low impact	4	4	16	Same as above	1	4	4	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	4	8
Water quality impacts - chemical, biological, and physical effects on marine ecosystems (sedimentation for example)		Smaller ships are generally older and have not upgraded their scrubbers. The larger ships have very strong environmental controls. What does stopping anchor do to the bottom? Impacts to ecological processes, flora and fauna. We were told that ship bottom has a coating that limits marine growth without toxic bottom paint.	2	3	6	Some potential impacts based on number of operating boats but education and policies may mitigate it.	3	3	9	Minor impacts	3	3	9	Same as above	1	3	3	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	3	6
SUBTOTAL																					
Category																					
				15	22					15	62					15	15				
COMMUNITY/CULTURAL																					
Category																					
Relief of downtown congestion and improvement in public safety and ease of traffic flow through new transportation options		Yes, refer to Tom Crikorian's report, but would adversely affect Route 3 traffic (as when the CAT operated), even as it lessens congestion at the town's pier area. More transportation required, because with current operation some passengers stay in town. Would need to address in future transportation plan.	4	7	28	Multi-use transportation facility reduces impacts of buses in town; trains reduce congestion downtown (assumes policy change on private use of parking spaces). Left turn onto Rt 3 is a negative. Water taxis could reduce congestion.	4	7	28	Expect partial relief of downtown congestion by moving all cruise ship bus activity from downtown parking spaces (assumes policy change on private use of parking spaces); left turn onto Rt 3 is a negative. Public transportation system is a positive.	5	7	35	Unknown because buyer is unknown. However, Town does have expectation (with MDOT) that any future buyer of property would responsibly own, develop, and operate property; possible risk if buyer does not meet these expectations	1	7	7	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	7	14
Quality of culture, life for MDI, Frenchman's Bay and effects on Acadia National Park and All American Road		More people would disembark with a berthing pier but flow of passengers would be more gradual	1	7	7	Improved views from land and water; in keeping with scale of other MDI communities; increased opportunity to access to Schoodic; compatible adjacent use for CDA and hotels with potential uses for students and guests.	5	7	35	Does not foster increase in cruise levels. Traffic emanating from new facility is offset by decrease in downtown traffic. Preserves scenic vistas from scenic bays.	5	7	35	Same as above	1	7	7	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	7	14
Quality of culture, life for residents of Bar Harbor including accessibility by public to waterfront at the ferry terminal property		Potential negative to quality of life because more people would get off the ships than the current 180,000. More access to town pier.	3	7	21	Increases public access to the ocean, and protects working waterfront and recreational heritage.	5	7	35	Very positive, increased public access to the waterfront	5	7	35	Same as above	1	7	7	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	7	14
Consistency with town planning goals - land use ordinance and comprehensive plans		May be inconsistent with comp plan, including Goal 1: Protect character of Bar Harbor; Goal 3: Economic development with low environmental impact; Goal 4: Protect marine resources industry. See detail below *	3	4	12	Consistent with Goal 1C, 1F, 1H, 3, 3E, 3F, 4 and 1.11.7 Vision Statement section B-1	5	4	20	Consistent with LUD and comp plan, which acknowledges need for additional parking. Protects character of Bar Harbor a facilitates public access to the water.	5	4	20	Same as above	1	4	4	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	4	8
SUBTOTAL																					
Category																					
				25	68					25	125					25	25				
LOCAL ECONOMY																					
Category																					
Benefits (S)/harm (L) to downtown merchants and restaurants		Depends on the transportation plan.	3	7	21	Reduces congestion to improve downtown experience, possible employee parking.	4	7	28	Some potential for harm from lost revenue due to need to shuttle downtown.	3	7	21	Unknown because buyer is unknown. However, Town does have expectation (with MDOT) that any future buyer of property would responsibly own, develop, and operate property; possible risk if buyer does not meet these expectations	1	7	7	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	7	14
Benefits/harm to hotels and B&B's		Less congestion downtown improves village but with potential increase in traffic on Eden St	3	3	9	Reduces downtown congestion which improves experience for guests, including providing transportation options for day activities and possible employee parking.	5	3	15	Easing congestion downtown and offering waterfront access and convenient tram service benefits accommodations	5	3	15	Same as above	1	3	3	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	3	6
Benefits/harm to fishermen and commercially owned boat operators and boardwalk operators (launching for example)		separates cruise passengers from current downtown harbor uses. Taxiffs from berthing may support additional waterside development to benefit commercial marine activity. Potentially conflicts with current commercial tendering services	3	4	12	Reduces congestion; increases dock space and services, potential for year-round operations.	4	4	16	Some relief from pier and water congestion for fishermen and improved conditions for commercial operators.	3	4	12	Same as above	1	4	4	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	4	8
Opportunities for potential commercially owned boat operators including water taxis and ferries, local and international		Approx. one third of hotel/hotel/inn rooms on MDI are within walking distance of Bar Harbor waterfront and town boats. Once a four boat move to Ferry Terminal result in a net gain of 0?	4	4	16	Much improved with strategies designed to accommodate all described uses	5	4	20	Much improved with strategies designed to accommodate all described uses	5	4	20	Same as above	1	4	4	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	4	8

Availability of parking in town and at the ferry terminal	parking availability would be improved at the town pier, but transportation plan is again critical.	4	7	28	Freeing up 4th parking spaces in town and adding 71-100 spaces at terminal is significant improvement.	4	7	28	Freeing up 4th parking spaces in town and adding 71-100 spaces at terminal is significant improvement.	4	7	28	Same as above	1	7	7	Without development, there is no impact. With development there is opportunity for benefit.	2	7	14
SUBTOTAL	Category		25	86			25	107			25	96			25	25			25	50
EXPERIENCE FOR CRUISE SHIP PASSENGERS																				
Ease and safety of disembark/embark	Improvement. More handicapped passengers can disembark.	5	2.5	11.5	No change. If tendering is accommodated at new facility, could be improvement relative to downtown facility and congestion.	3	2.5	7.5	3.6% of passenger injuries are due to tendering. State of the art ADA compliant equipment would improve safety features.	4	2.5	10	Unknown because buyer is unknown. However, Town does have expectation (with MDOIT) that any future buyer of property would responsibly own, develop, and operate property; possible risk if buyer does not meet these expectations	1	2.5	2.5	No impact, without development property would not be open to the public	1	2.5	2.5
Transportation once on shore	Improvement, less confusing for passengers.	4	2	8	One more transportation mode required but more organized than downtown. Potential for water taxis to move passengers.	3	2	6	Will be improved if some passengers tender to new facility which will be more structured and organized than existing service, however adding additional layer of transportation to go downtown may be a factor.	4	2	8	Same as above	1	2	2	No impact, without development property would not be open to the public	1	2	2
Opportunity to enjoy town/Park	Mixed, requires transport to downtown for shopping	3	1.5	4.5	Increased potential for access to Schoodic, visually consistent waterfront throughout Park Viewshed.	3	1.5	4.5	Harder to get to town from new facility, but improved access to Acadia. Potentially most helpful to those with limited mobility.	3	1.5	4.5	Same as above	1	1.5	1.5	No impact, without development property would not be open to the public	1	1.5	1.5
Opportunity to enjoy ferry terminal property and improved access to Frenchman Bay	Depends on accessibility, small-scale, (personal) water-based recreation and cruise ships don't tend to mix well	3	1.5	4.5	Increased recreational opportunities at transportation hub/ferry terminal property.	5	1.5	7.5	Improved access	5	1.5	7.5	Same as above	1	1.5	1.5	No impact, without development property would not be open to the public	1	1.5	1.5
SUBTOTAL	Category		7.5	29.5			7.5	25.5			7.5	30			7.5	7.5			7.5	7.5
EXPERIENCE FOR LAND-BASED TOURISTS																				
Parking	Would need to know how much buses will dominate the property, priority will obviously be for cruise ship passenger transport, not more general island transport	4	2	8	Additional spaces in town and at new facility; improved transportation options. Tram and new parking at terminal will be fare free.	4	2	8	Additional spaces in town and at new facility; improved transportation options. Tram and new parking at terminal will be fare free.	4	2	8	Unknown because buyer is unknown. However, Town does have expectation (with MDOIT) that any future buyer of property would responsibly own, develop, and operate property; possible risk if buyer does not meet these expectations	1	2	2	No impact, without development property would not be open to the public	1	2	2
Opportunity to enjoy ferry terminal property and improved access to Frenchman Bay	Negative: this pier becomes the domain of the cruise ships and their passengers, not other MDI visitors	1	1	1	Multiple new recreation and appreciation options.	5	1	5	Positive	5	1	5	Unknown because buyer is unknown	1	1	1	No change to beauty of Frenchman Bay. Potential for enjoyment and access to bay.	1	1	1
Opportunity to enjoy town/Park	Diversion of cruise ships relieves congestion downtown. Transportation hub allows better management of Park access	3	2.5	7.5	Tram service to town improves experience of downtown, visually consistent throughout park viewshed; better experience on cruise days and increased access to Acadia and Schoodic.	5	2.5	12.5	No change in enjoyment of Park for residents but positive improvement for access to Schoodic in AM. Tram service to town improves experience of downtown, visually consistent throughout park viewshed; better experience on cruise days and increased access to Acadia and Schoodic.	5	2.5	12.5	Unknown because buyer is unknown	1	2.5	2.5	Does not improve or change current conditions	1	2.5	2.5
Increased opportunity for transportation options such as water taxis and ferries including Winter Harbor ferry	Would depend on the design. Increased tariffs may support development of transportation hub	3	2	6	Tram, water taxis, Winter Harbor ferry; increased access and parking and possible new driving tours; potential for international ferry.	5	2	10	Availability of floats and piers increases transportation options. Tram, water taxis, Winter Harbor ferry; increased access and parking and possible new driving tours; potential for international ferry.	5	2	10	Unknown because buyer is unknown	1	2	2	No impact. With development, there is potential to help with transportation issues.	1	2	2
SUBTOTAL			7.5	22.5			7.5	35.5			7.5	35.5			7.5	7.5			7.5	7.5
TOTALS			100	268			100	422			100	428.5			100	144			100	299
Rating Scale																				
Least Desirable for Site Selection = 1																				
Not Desirable but Potentially Acceptable for Site Selection = 2																				
Acceptable for Site Selection = 3																				
Potentially Desirable for Site Selection = 4																				
Most Desirable for Site Selection = 5																				
<p>COMP PLAN: GOAL 1 Protect the character of Bar Harbor; Policy 1B Comply with State Shoreland Zoning; Policy 1C: Protect natural, scenic, and cultural preservation; Policy 1F: Preserve scenic views; Policy 1J Preserve historic resources; Policy 1G, Protect the quality of coastal air; Policy 1L: Develop additional parks and trails; Policy 1N: Preserve important natural resources and open space. GOAL 3: Encourages economic development that has low environmental impact and supports a year-round economy; Policy 3E stress managing tour bus and cruise ship passengers and setting limits on the latter. GOAL 4: Protect the marine resources industry and increase shore access for commercial fishermen and the public. Bar Harbor LUD Section 125-3: Purpose: protecting aquatic life, protecting visual as well as actual access to coastal waters, natural beauty and open spaces. Section 125-48(B)(5)(d) pier size consistent with surrounding character of area.</p>																				